

Feedback Worksheet

BJCP Prep-8 **Part 1**

Descriptor Definitions (Mark all that apply)

- Y **Acetaldehyde**—Green apple-like aroma and flavor
- Y **Alcoholic**—The aroma, flavor, and warming effect of ethanol and higher alcohols.
- Y **Astringent**—Puckering, lingering harshness and/or dryness in the finish/aftertaste; Harsh graininess.
- Y **Diacetyl**—Artificial butter, butterscotch, or toffee aroma and flavor. Sometimes perceived as a slickness on the tongue.
- Y **DMS (dimethyl sulfide)**—At low levels a sweet, corn-like aroma and flavor. At higher levels may be perceived as cooked, canned, or rotten vegetables.
- Y **Estery**—Aroma and/or flavor of any ester. Many are similar to various fruits.
- Y **Light-struck**—Similar to the aroma of a skunk.
- Y **Metallic**—Tinny, coin, blood-like flavor.
- Y **Oxidized/Stale**—Any one or combination of winy, cardboard, papery, or sherry-like aromas and flavors
- Y **Phenolic**—Any one or combination of medicinal, plastic, smoky, plastic adhesive strip, or clove-like aromas and flavors.
- Y **Solvent**—Aromas and flavors of higher alcohols (fusel alcohols). Similar to acetone or lacquer thinner aromas.
- Y **Sour/Acidic**—Tartness in aroma and flavor. Can be sharp and clean (lactic acid), vinegar-like (acetic acid), or lemony (citric acid). Sensation experienced mostly on the side of tongue.
- Y **Sulfur (hydrogen sulfide)**—The aroma of rotten eggs or burning matches.
- Y **Vegetal**—Cooked, canned, or rotten vegetable aroma and flavor.

Subcategory: *Keep first in mind! Judge to style.*

Bottle Inspection: *Fill levels should be 1/2–1 1/2". Low levels can indicate lack of carbonation as well as oxidation. High fill levels with yeast in bottles can be over carbonated. Green or clear bottles can be lightstruck. Ring around bottles can mean contamination. Points are **not** taken off for any of these. Judges may mention the order the beer was received (e.g., 2nd of 8)*

Appearance (as appropriate for style) **3**
 Comment on color, clarity, and head (retention, color, and texture)

Lack of clarity can be from: Lack of a long/vigorous boil (1 1/2 hrs. is common for a non-cloudy style), inadequate lagering/aging, poor flocculating yeast, contamination, over milling malt.

Clarity in an unfiltered wheat style can be from extensive aging.

Lack of head retention can be from: higher alcohols, oversparging, hard water, and dirty cups/glass. Also see lack of clarity reasons

Mouthfeel (as appropriate for style) **5**
 Comment on body, carbonation, warmth, creaminess, astringency, and other palate sensations

Over carbonation (gushing) can be from contamination or over priming (check for sediment in the bottle). Moderate carbonation uses 3/4c. sugar/5-gallons. With beers lagered extensively, some fresh yeast during priming (bottle conditioning) can help. With forces carbonation (look for no sediment), the keg should be pumped up more and be close to freezing, and use cold bottles.

Full body can be from high mash temperatures, some specialty malts. If combined with wort or cloying flavor this can mean lack of yeast attenuation (aerate more upon pitching, use more yeast). Low body can be from low mash temp, adjuncts such as kettle sugars, contamination (especially when there is too much carbonation and/or sourness).

Astringency can be from oversparging (see Part 2) or overcrushing malt.

Overall Impression **10**
 Comment on overall drinking pleasure associated with entry (1) give suggestions for improvement (2). Be polite. Don't assume. Be helpful. Be honest.

"This is what I would expect for the style. Good job!"

"Very drinkable beer! However I think it is more of a(n)....."

"Recipe seems right on! Maybe next time try....."

"This beer has its share of problems. But don't give up! Try....."

"This reminds me of (classic beer)."

1. Check out a homebrew club in your area.
2. Read books such as NCJOHB, Dave Miller's homebrewing guide, Zymurgy magazine, Designing Great Beers- Daniels.
3. Local homebrew shop may be of assistance.

Brewers can be encouraged to use phone number or e-mail to contact judges regarding help in competitions. The 3 points listed are more for competitions and not the exam.

Feedback Worksheet

BJCP Prep-8

Part 2

Descriptor Definitions (Mark all that apply)

Some are acceptable/appropriate to some extent.

1. - **Acetaldehyde**—Green apple-like aroma and flavor
2. +, - **Alcoholic**—The aroma, flavor, and warming effect of ethanol and higher alcohols.
4. (-) **Astringent**—Puckering, lingering harshness and/or dryness in the finish/aftertaste; Harsh graininess.
- 1., 3. (-) **Diacetyl**—Artificial butter, butterscotch, or toffee aroma and flavor. Sometimes perceived as a slickness on the tongue.
5. (-) **DMS (dimethyl sulfide)**—At low levels a sweet, corn-like aroma and flavor. At higher levels may be perceived as cooked, canned, or rotten vegetables.
2. +, - **Estery**—Aroma and/or flavor of any ester. Many are similar to various fruits.
6. - **Light-struck**—Similar to the aroma of a skunk.
7. - **Metallic**—Tinny, coin, blood-like flavor.
8. -, + **Oxidized/Stale**—Any one or combination of winy, cardboard, papery, or sherry-like aromas and flavors
3. -, + **Phenolic**—Any one or combination of medicinal, plastic, smoky, plastic adhesive strip, or clove-like aromas and flavors.
2. - **Solvent**—Aromas and flavors of higher alcohols (fusel alcohols). Similar to acetone or lacquer thinner aromas.
3. -, + **Sour/Acidic**—Tartness in aroma and flavor. Can be sharp and clean (lactic acid), vinegar-like (acetic acid), or lemony (citric acid). Sensation experienced mostly on the side of tongue.
9. (-) **Sulfur (hydrogen sulfide)**—The aroma of rotten eggs or burning matches. Yeasty.
3. - **Vegetal**—Cooked, canned, or rotten vegetable aroma and flavor.

Entrant please note: Please write to the BJCP with concerns or complaints about the appropriateness or tone of judges' comments. Include copies of score sheets.

Further reading: Zymurgy special issue 1987 (Vol. 10, No.4), *Brewing Lager Beer*- Noonan, *Principals Of Brewing Science*-Fix.

Based on appropriateness to style and intensity

1. Age longer- At least one more day at room temperature before crashing temperature. Varies by yeast strain.
2. Fermentation temperature too high. Hefes no higher than 72° F. most other ales below 70° F. Alt, Kölsch, Cream Ale, Steam, Scottish Ales below 63° F. Lagers in the low 50s. Temperatures approximate and somewhat dependent on gravity and yeast strain. "Chico Ale" strain tends to be forgiving.
3. The more that are inappropriately present the more sure you can be of a contaminated beer. Especially with lack of clarity/haze. Change all plastic equipment, especially with acetic contamination. Cool wort quickly (30 min.) in order to pitch yeast sooner. High quality/quantity yeast to start in 2 hrs. (lagers may be longer to start). Sanitation: Use strong enough, high quality cleaners and sanitizers. Keep brewing, transfer, packaging area and equipment very clean and sanitize equipment just before using. Visually inspect closely.
Lactic problem can be from milling grains in the brewing/fermentation area or from oral contact with siphon.
4. Don't oversparge- Keep sparge water no higher than 168° F and pH lower than 7 (adjust with gypsum, calcium chloride, lactic or phosphoric acid if necessary). Last runnings should be higher than 1.010 with pH below 6. Can be caused by extract beers with grains steeped above 170° F (or wringing out steeping bag).
5. Avoid by a full rolling boil for at least 1 ½ hrs. Cool wort quickly (1/2 to 1 hr.). Do not let steam condense back into kettle. Acceptable to a low extent for pale lagers.
6. Keep beer and fermenting wort out of the light.
7. Check equipment for rust (including bottle caps). Kettle usually not a problem. Iron in water, common in wells.
8. Well aged (sherry) in some strong beers is fine. Or too old (cardboard and paper- Never OK) or abused. Watch splashing at all stages (except when pitching yeast for primary fermentation). Keep finished beer cool. Watch aging times. Bottle conditioned beers less susceptible. Inevitable over time.
9. More typical of lagers. Lager longer to lessen/eliminate. May have been in contact with yeast too long at higher temperatures (above 50° or 55° F for lagers).

More Philosophy

While it should go without saying that the specifics of each of the five sections is mentioned under the heading, it is too common to see mouthfeel comments in the flavor section (especially body and astringency) or obvious characteristics like body and carbonation ignored (or overlooked). Consider also that the characteristics listed under each section are instructions for what to comment on. This is good to think of when you are short on comments.

A good description is more than random notes. An excellent scoresheet should paint a good picture of the overall experience of the beer being judged. The more words the better, especially if you're not being redundant. A grader may point out the lack of words (quantity) as well as quality.

Merely saying "malty" does not suffice. What kind of malt (or malt flavors) as well as quantifying the characteristics describes. If something is not there, by all means mention it (i.e., "No hops, but acceptable for the style").

The first four sections cover the "facts" with the scores being based on the style as mentioned in the style guidelines. The last one is your opinion. This also demands specifics. "Watch sanitation" is not really **good** feedback as it is not specific. It merely hints at a suggestion for improvement. The Feedback Worksheets are meant to show specific feedback for the characteristics that may be checked on the left side.

The "+" and "-" before the descriptors are meant to imply a negative or positive connotation of the descriptors (this can be style dependant so some have both signs). The "(" imply something conditional or unavoidable (all beers are astringent to some extent or at least it's been suggested [Meilgard]).

It is beyond the scope of the Feedback Worksheets to deal with recipe issues. This is the most challenging aspect of feedback and takes much experience.

This is especially the time to be humble and unassuming in your comments. It may be easy in some cases to comment when there is too much of something. It's easy to say "More malt." But you can be specific. There is a difference between base malt and chocolate (or crystal) malt.

This should make the brewing judge more adept than the non-brewing judge. There is no substitute for judging experience!

How you say something is many times as important as what you say. While it's important to be descriptive and honest, it's also important to be tactful. See "Entrants note" above. Arrogance won't get you anywhere if you want someone to listen to you (especially if they don't know you). Tactfulness is critical when helping someone with a bad beer. The idea is to help the brewer.

Judging is also an opportunity to learn. Judging with a more experienced judge can improve your own skill. Likewise, it can also be an opportunity to teach. Tact is still the key. In real life judging, how you deal with your fellow judges is critical too. It's better to say, "I don't get that (characteristic)" rather than say, "No, you're way off." Be a contributor at the judging table. Help people make better beer. You could benefit at the next competition by having better beer to judge if you succeed by helping a brewer.

Word List

(Descriptors when judging. This is meant to show how to go beyond just a generic “malty” or “hoppy.” In other words, be descriptive. Go to www.bjcp.org/cep/vocab/)

MALT

Caramel
Bready
Toasty
Rich
Deep
Roasty
Chocolate
Black malt
Burnt
Smoked malt
Bread crust
Cloying

YEAST

Medicinal
Sulfur
Bready/yeasty
Clove
Spicy
Belgian
Rubbery

MOUTHFEEL

Warming
Fizzy, effervescent
Harsh
Silky
Thin, watery

HOPS

herbal
grassy
grapefruit
citrus
flowery
cheesy
course
earthy
spicy
noble (but use other descriptors with this)

ESTERS

banana, bubblegum
rose
plum
raspberry
pear, red apple
raisin, prune
stone fruit

Musty, mushroom
Specific vegetable
Tobacco
Honey, licorice
Earthy

Not what I would expect. OK for style. Distinct, complex, clean, subdued/subtle, intense/robust, lingering.

Words to avoid

Nice (for the most part), bad, putrid, awful, etc. Extract (as in “Tastes like an extract beer”), Undrinkable, Appropriate (as in “color is appropriate” instead of “Light amber color”)

This is meant to **not** repeat what is on the Beer Flavor Wheel and descriptors on the judging sheets. Nor is it complete. The BJCP CEP committee is working on defining many descriptive words.

Judging Etiquette/ Procedures Philosophy

When receiving beer during judging pass them without delay to your fellow judges.

No noises/comments/faces while others are judging. This means other tables also—watching politely should be OK.

Communicate with stewards as to keeping beers once judged.

Do not pour beer for stewards—they can get their own once you are completely done.

Do not take the time to train a steward as a judge until your panel is finished with the entry.

Don't condemn a beer on the basis of one constituent (such as color). Consider the creativity and originality of the brewer.

Read guidelines out loud before starting. Make sure your fellow judges at your panel do also (not all at once—alternate)

Consider honorable mentions and other awards.

Don't guess who made the beer.

Don't criticize judges (e.g., a bad bottle can make it to a BOS round).

Don't judge the same categories you usually do or just your favorites. Be flexible.

Discuss entries as needed and politely.

Re-taste as needed. But only as needed.

Judge to style! And not what you think the style should be or what you like (i.e. Malty, Hoppy, Strong). Overall impression in the style description should be considered a good summary of what the style is about.

Be helpful, polite, unassuming, and professional. Consider the lower the score the more you should write.

A first time judge can indicate “first time judge” on their score sheet to indicate new judge status.

Keep in mind that the style guideline is that—a **guideline**. Styles evolve and change. Hence the updating of the BJCP *Style Guidelines* as deemed necessary. Keep an open mind, but this still has the final word on a style when judging.

Also pages 10-17 of the BJCP Study Guide and page ii of the 2008 *Style Guidelines*